

**Government of Sindh
School Education and Literacy Department (SELD)**

**DRAFT
STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT PLAN**

**SINDH EARLY LEARNING ENHANCEMENT THROUGH
CLASSROOM TRANSFORMATION
(SELECT)
P172834**

16th July, 2020

Contents

List of Acronyms.....	2
1. Introduction.....	4

2. Summary of Previous Stakeholder Activities.....	6
3. Stakeholder Identification and Analysis	7
4. Stakeholder Engagement.....	31
5. Roles, Responsibilities, and Resources for Stakeholder Engagement Plan.....	45
6. Grievance Mechanism	46
7. Monitoring and Reporting	47

List of Acronyms

ASC	Annual School Census
CE	Citizen Engagement
CPD	Continuous Professional Development
CPM	Chief Program Manager
DCAR	Directorate of Curriculum, Assessment, and Research
DDMA	District Disaster Management Authority
DEOs	District Education Officer
DSE	Directorate of School Education
DTG M&E	Directorate General of Monitoring and Evaluation
EGRA	Early Grade Reading Assessment
ESPIG	Education Sector Program Implementation Grants
FGD	Focus Group Discussion
GBV	Gender Based Violence
GER	Gross Enrolment Ratio
GPE	Global Partnership for Education
HDI	Human Development Index
HMs	Head Masters/Mistresses
IDI	In-Depth Interview

JD	Job Description
NGO	Non-Governmental Organization
OIPs	Other Interested Parties
OOSC	Out of School Children
PD&F	Planning Department and Finance
PDMA	Provincial Disaster Management Authority
PITE	Provincial Institute of Training and Education
POM	Project Orientation Manual
PMIU	Project Monitoring and Implementation Unit
RSU	Reform Support Unit
SAT	Standard Achievement Test
SBCA	Sindh Building Control Authority
SELD	Sindh Education and Literacy Department
SELECT	Sindh Early Learning Enhancement Through Classroom Transformation
SEPA	Sindh Environment Protection Agency
SEP	Stakeholder Engagement Plan
SMC	School Management
STEDA	Sindh Teacher Education Development Authority
TA	Technical Assistance
TEOs	<i>Taluka</i> Education Officer
TTI	Teacher Training Institute
UC	Union Council
WASH	Water, Sanitation, and Hygiene
WB	World Bank

1. Introduction

1.1 Project Description

Sindh Early Learning Enhancement through Classroom Transformation (SELECT) is a five-year project. It is to be funded by Education Sector Program Implementation Grants (ESPIG) of the Global Partnership for Education (GPE) and the World Bank (WB). The financial funding is set to be US\$ 129.99 million. However, it is likely to increase with addition of multiplier grant from GPE. Sindh Education and Literacy Department (SELD) is the implementing agency. The project offers a multipronged approach to aligning school-level factors that will lead to improvement in the quality of teaching and learning practices for grades 1 through 3 in public sector schools in Sindh. The project has four major components as illustrated in Table 1.

Table 1: Project Components

Components	Sub Components
Component 1: Transforming teaching practices in the early grades	1.1 Implementation of a Continuous Professional Development (CPD) model for improved literacy skills in the early grades 1.2 Behavioral Nudges for Improved Learning
Component 2: Developing an effective learning environment	2.1 School Upgradation to Elementary Schools 2.2 Improving learning spaces in schools 2.3 provision of WASH facilities
Component 3: Improving system capacity for better school leadership and management support	3.1 Establishing a technology-based student attendance monitoring system 3.2 Capacity building for school leadership and local

	education office management to mitigate student dropout
Component 4: Technical assistance and project management	4.1 Technical assistance for institutional strengthening 4.2 Monitoring and Evaluation and project management

1.2 Project Objective

The development objective is to improve reading skills of early grade primary students and increase student retention in primary schools in selected project districts.

Table 2: List of Target Districts & Regions

	Districts	Regions
1	Kashmore	Larkana
2	Ghotki	Sukkur
3	Tando Muhammad Khan	Hyderabad
4	Badin	Hyderabad
5	Jacobabad	Larkana
6	Mirpur Khas	Mirpurkhas
7	Sujawal	Hyderabad
8	Thatta	Hyderabad
9	Sanghar	Shaheed Benazirabad
10	Tharparkar	Mirpurkhas

1.4 Summary of Potential Environment Impacts

The proposed Project is to be implemented in the ten selected districts¹ of Sindh. The districts have been identified based on scoring across six indicators². Within these districts, schools in approximately 100

¹ Kashmore, Ghotki, Tando Muhammad Khan, Badin, Jacobabad, Mirpur Khas, Sujawal, Thatta, Sanghar, Tharparkar

(likely to increase) union councils, the local government tier within *talukas*, will be specifically supported by the project activities. Approximately 500 schools will be upgraded and will receive full package of interventions from all the project components. The upgradation and rehabilitation activities will include refurbishing of existing classrooms and adding new classrooms to existing schools, provision of furniture, and adequate Water, Sanitation and Hygiene (WASH) facilities. Where relevant, solar panels will also be added to meet the electricity demands. The remaining schools in the same union councils and/or districts will receive enhanced service provision through improved teacher training and administrative systems supported under components 1 and 3.

Major environmental issues common in the selected districts are health hazards stemming from lack of access to safe drinking water and from poor sanitation and hygiene. The main factors associated with this environmental health risk are limited household water supply coverage, distance to the drinking water source, poor household water quality, limited treatment of drinking water at the point of use, limited access to sanitation facilities, and lack of hygiene. There is deficiency of proper solid waste management system in the project districts. Nine out of the ten selected districts (Jacobabad, Kashmore, Ghotki, Sanghar, Jamshoro, Thatta and Tando Muhammad Khan, Badin, Thatta, and Sajawal) are prone to risk of high floods, three (Badin, Thatta and Sajawal) are additionally prone to risk of cyclones, while one (Tharparkar) is prone to drought. Sindh Wildlife Department recognizes various game reserves and wildlife sanctuaries across different districts of the province.

1.5 Summary of Potential Social Impacts

Primary social issues in the selected districts relate to labor and working conditions, community health and safety especially that of school children and staff. Apprehension of harassment of school children, lady teachers and district-level female staff of SELD, gender discrimination (boys versus girls education), and biases against vulnerable people present equity and inclusion challenges. In addition, selection of union councils with vulnerable groups needs to be considered carefully. Rural union councils in all these zones/areas have low HDI scores and incomes. Most often, there is a tendency to ignore these areas due to their locations, low political influence and higher costs of engagement/transaction costs. This can be the case in this project unless mitigated through project design.

2. Summary of Previous Stakeholder Activities

Table 3: Previous Activities Under SELECT Preparation

S.N	Activity	Description
1	Sindh Education Sector Plan and Road Map – 34 th Meeting of the Local Education Group (LEG) 19 Aug 2019 Karachi	Briefing on Program Development Grant Proposal

² (i) Gross Enrollment Ratio (GER) in primary education, (ii) Standard Achievement Test (SAT) scores of grade , (iii) gender parity index in enrolment rate, (iv) ratio of primary to elementary schools, (v) dropout rates from grade 5 to 6, and (vi) percentage of schools with 2 classrooms or less.

2	Sindh Education Sector Plan Implementation Grant (ESPIG), Consultative Workshop 26 Sep 2019 Karachi	Details of program development procedure under GPE guidelines; Review of key sector indicators, current constraints and issues; Review of updated and endorsed priority programs in SESP&R 2019-24
3	School Education Sector Plan and Road Map for Sindh – 36 th Meeting of the Local Education Group (LEG) 30th Jan 2020 Karachi	Briefing & Discussion on “Sindh Early Learning Enhancement through Classroom Transformation Project (SELECT)”
4	EdTech Consultation 4th Feb 2020 Karachi	Sessions focused on individualized student attendance and learning monitoring and digital solutions teacher training and reference resources. EDTech startups, SELD representatives, and development agencies participated
5	Innovative School Design workshop 6th Feb 2020 Karachi	Discussions on creating conducive learning environments to be implemented through Component 2. Sessions attended by architects, civil engineers, furniture suppliers, interior designers, Sindh Disaster Management Authority, development agencies, and SELD representatives

3. Stakeholder Identification and Analysis

For the purpose of the SEP, the term “affected parties” includes “those likely to be affected by the project because of actual impacts or potential risks to their physical environment, health, security, cultural practices, wellbeing, or livelihoods. These stakeholders may include individuals or groups, including local communities” (World Bank, 2018b). The “**Affected Parties**” in the SELECT context refer to all those stakeholders who are either involved in direct implementation of the project components, who are recipients of the project benefits, or/and those who are likely to be adversely impacted by it. Stakeholder mapping of project components and listing of implementing agencies and project beneficiaries in other components through secondary review of the project documents and initial input from the Reform Support Unit (RSU) have guided in identifying the stakeholders under this category.

The **Other Interested Parties (OIPs)** refer to individuals, groups, or organizations with an interest in the project, which may be because of the project location, its characteristics, or matters related to public interest. They may include regulators, government officials, the private sector, private academics, associations, educational organizations, and other civil society organizations. In the context of the project the relevant organizations of the SELD, local and international non-government organizations working independently or in conjunction with SELD on similar components within the selected districts, community based organizations representing minority groups as well as the environment protection authorities are being considered as OIPs. These stakeholders are not going to be directly responsible for execution of any project component. However, based on their experience and knowledge they can

either assist in informed decision making for different components of SELECT. In some cases, due to lack of information about the project components, some OIPs might play a negative role in hindering the project progress. On the other hand, if all stakeholders in this category collaborate with the project, then such collaboration will be beneficial for not only the project, but also for such OIPs as well. The likelihood of OIPs' negative role in project implementation is low.

Disadvantaged/vulnerable individuals or groups are potentially disproportionately affected and less able to benefit from opportunities offered by the project due to specific difficulties to access and/or understand information about the project and its environmental and social impacts and mitigation strategies. In this project **individuals or groups of individuals** who should be the intended direct beneficiaries of the project, but are at risk of being alienated/marginalized are therefore vulnerable or disadvantaged. Socio-cultural demand-side barriers combined with economic factors and supply-related issues (such as availability of school facility), together are likely to hamper enrolment and retention of certain marginalized groups, in particular girls and differently abled children³. Sindh overall demonstrates harmonious co-existence of multiple ethnic and religious groups. Generally, incidence of exclusion either on religious or ethnic grounds has not been observed in school enrolment or in the overall education system. However, in order to champion social inclusion, the project will engage with all such groups so as to minimize grievances and marginalization of any individual and group with special needs.

Last three Annual School Census reports by RSU will be reviewed to identify trends for the vulnerable and disadvantaged groups, district and gender wise. As this group consists of minors too, most effective and appropriate means of engagement needs will be determined in consultation with relevant parties during the course of SEP development.

3.1 Affected Parties

Table 4: Level of Impact on Affected Parties

S.N	Affected Party	Level of Impact
1	Primary students (1-5) and their parents	+ High: Will positively benefit through improved teaching pedagogies and availability of learning tools and improved facilities
2	Elementary students (6-8) and their parents	+ High: Expected to increase retention. Opportunity, especially for girls to continue education
3	Primary teachers	+ - High: Increased capacity and access to teaching resources for improved learning outcomes, but are unlikely to advance in career
4	Primary headmasters/mistresses	- High: In case of up gradation of "cell/ hub schools," there is a likelihood of transfers
5	Elementary headmasters/mistresses (HMs)	+ High: Fresh recruitment through third party and promotions of senior teachers to Grade 17 in this post
6	Taluka Education Officers (TEOs)	+ - High: Redefined roles and responsibilities for engagement on academic matters rather administrative.

³ Differently abled in the project context include children with minor to medium physical immobility and learning disorders

7	District Education Officers (DEOs)	+ - High: Bifurcation of responsibilities between DEOs, Deputy DEOs, and TEOs will lead to result based management. Might cause displeasure and conflict over new roles
8	Sindh Teacher Education Development Authority (STEDA)	+ Moderate: Improved coordination between STEDA, PITE and TTIs
9	Provincial Institute of Training and Education (PITE)	+ High: PITE will lead in managing all the CPD activities in the field
10	Teacher Training Institutes (TTIs)	+ High: Strengthened through technical services provided by the third party service providers.
11	Directorate of Curriculum, Assessment, and Research (DCAR)	+ High: Increased implementation capacity and TA for establishing EGRA instruments
12	Directorate General of Monitoring and Evaluation (DTG M&E)	+ High: Role of DG M&E will be enhanced as being the main stakeholder in implementation of technology-based student attendance monitoring system and its monitoring and reporting processes under the project.
13	School Education Works Wing	+ High: Direct stakeholder in implementation of the component-2 of the project.
14	Reform Support Unit	+ High: Technical assistance through RSU will strengthen capacity of related implementing entities' in particular and that of SELD in general

3.1.1 Issues to be Addressed for Effective and Inclusive Engagement with Affected Parties

Based on primary consultations with teachers, HMs and Curriculum Wing some important points inferred are listed below:

- a) **Primary Teachers:** With limited space, inadequate facilities, over-sized classes, and multi-grade teaching, teachers are forced to enroll more students. In case of non-compliance they face pressures from community and various stakeholders.. This pressure has to be reduced amicably without affecting school and teacher's performance.
- b) Multi-grade teaching has put a disproportionate burden on teachers to cover entire syllabi in available days in the academic year. It is difficult for teachers to repeat and reinforce lessons with students who have lower comprehension levels. Similarly, it is exceptionally hard for pupils to retain and reconnect to previous lessons through practice at home as they lack parental support and guidance. This has been one of the reasons for low academic performance in the target age groups. As the project transitions from multi-grade teaching to school expansion, CPD modules need to ensure that teaching pedagogies focus on reinforcing and increasing comprehension of concepts through use of modern and engaging classroom tools. Similarly, home assignments and exercises need to be equally exciting and engaging for children to practice concepts without

parental supervision or guidance. The SE&LD needs to address this aspect of multi-grade teaching and related issues of students' learning outcomes, under this project if possible; or through any other related assignment.

- c) **Senior Teachers:** Many of the primary teachers are senior by age and close to retirement. Some of them are likely to show disinterest in new pedagogies. Therefore, the young teachers may be given preference in selection for the CPD program. This will probably demonstrate the efficacy of the program in a shorter span and discourage negative discourse against it by senior staff within the system
- d) **Reporting and Communication between and amongst School Staff and Taluka/District Management:** Teachers and HMs though communicate with DEOs and TEOs through written application, phone calls, and WhatsApp messages. However, a formal system of filing and maintaining official correspondence is very weak, and in some cases non-existent, making proper and timely handling of complaint tracking obscure
- e) **Teacher transfers** are a common practice. It is usually done by DEOs without taking concerned HMs on board, and in some cases even without provision of replacement of outgoing teacher. In the project, if trained teachers are transferred, the entire "district center" can be adversely affected and would experience delays in devolving support to "cell schools." The transfer policy must attend to this issue
- f) **Selection of Guide Teachers and Subject Coordinators:** In the past, various different mechanisms have been found to be used by different development organizations in the selection of Guide Teachers and Subject Coordinators. Some organizations, when carried out their program, they themselves nominated Guide Teachers and Subject Coordinators. In some instances TEOs directly made the nominations and in other instances HMs were asked to send their recommendations. In some cases HMs were not consulted when teachers were sent to trainings by TEOs or DEOs. Since Guide Teachers and Subject Coordinators are to play a crucial role in devolving training at the Union Council (UC)/*taluka* level, it is important to standardize the selection process based on teachers' performance and other relevant factors. At the same time, gender sensitivities in terms of training timings and personal safety and security also need to be factored in.
- g) **TEOs and DEOs:** The Job Descriptions (JDs) of TEOs and DEOs will be reviewed as part of SEP development to make their roles more supportive to the HMs, Teachers, CPD activities, enrolment, student retention, etc.
- h) **Teaching resource material development** involves several agencies. The Curriculum Wing develops the guidelines, DCAR and PITE draft content, STEDA accredits resource material, without which it cannot be formally used. Finally the Sindh Textbook Board publishes and distributes resource materials. Delays in the entire process are common without holding any agency responsible. The success of the project depends on making relevant teaching resource and aid materials timely available. To meet the stated challenges, it is important that all agencies engaged

in this process collaborate and mutually decide on set timelines by developing annual plans and calendars.

3.1.2 Description of Affected Parties

Stakeholder Group	Identified Party	Key Characteristics	Needs/Issues	Preferred Notification and Frequency	Specific Needs
Affected Parties	Primary students (Grades 1-5) and their parents	Represent 42 percent of the student population in the selected districts at the primary level; mostly enrolled in one to two room schools and learning through multi grade system; belong mainly to lower socio-economic classes; One School Management Committee (SMC) consisting of parent members are required by law for each school in Sindh, which have been constituted to help improve school performance , spending	Poor reading and numeracy skills; At risk of dropping out before completing primary education due to low interest in school activities; low levels of comprehension; Assessment tools in most cases are redundant for timely intervention; No proper way of tracking and bringing back dropouts; SMCs are dysfunctional in most cases as the members are mostly unclear/unaware of SMCs functions. SELECT may want to use these platforms for mobilizing communities for improved project results	<u>Design Phase:</u> 1 IDI with an NGO representing children’s rights, <u>Operation Phase:</u> Participation of Children’s Rights NGOs in LEG meetings; Annual meeting of SMCs	School in close proximity to home; Availability of basic infrastructure and furniture (chairs, desks, washrooms etc. ; modern learning tools; libraries

		enrolment etc.			
	Elementary Students (Grades 6-8)	Represent 33 percent of the student population in the select districts at the elementary level; belong mainly to lower socio-economic classes; SMCs are required for Elementary Schools as well	The ratio of primary to elementary schools is 16:1 respectively; Enrolment of girls drastically drops at the elementary level; Outreach programs/mechanisms to encourage parents to enroll children, especially girls, in elementary do not exist or are very weak; Alternate economic uses of child labor also contribute; As in the case of primary schools, SMCs at the Elementary School level are mostly dysfunctional as well; They can play a critical role if mobilized and revitalized.	<u>Design Phase:</u> 1 IDI with an NGO representing children's rights <u>Operation Phase:</u> Participation of Children's Rights NGOs in LEG meetings; Annual meeting of SMCs	School in close proximity to home; Transport; Availability of basic infrastructure and furniture (chairs, desks, washrooms etc.; modern learning tools; libraries
	Primary Teachers	27,788 primary teachers in the selected districts are on the payroll; Minimum qualification requirement as of 2014 is graduate but majority of	Majority of the teachers, appointed in the late eighties and early nineties are underqualified; Appointees of the eighties and nineties did not go through induction training and are now close to	<u>Design Phase:</u> 6 FGDs; Participation in Consultative Workshops <u>Operation Phase:</u> 1 Annual Project Planning Meeting in Hyderabad/Su kkur at start of	Training aid materials; Transport facilities for teachers commuting from urban areas to schools in rural areas ; TA/DA for participation in annual

		<p>the in-service primary teachers were appointed in the late eighties and early nineties and are matriculated</p>	<p>retirement; In 2014-2015 new teachers were recruited through third party tests; New recruits are young graduates and more open to learning and capacity development; CPD model is going to be effectively announced and rolled out in all project districts; Primary teachers have repeatedly expressed that multi-grade teaching is ineffective and expectations of the existing curriculum are very high and unreasonable</p>	<p>the project; 4 Annual Review Meetings in Hyderabad/Su kkur Annual Training for different batches of teachers (can be at PITE or District TTI); Monthly review meetings of Guide and Subject Coordinators at Hub schools; Bi-weekly meetings of Subject Coordinators and teachers at satellite schools; Weekly mentoring by Subject Coordinators to teachers at satellite schools</p>	<p>meetings and trainings; Refreshment budget for review and weekly meetings; Daytime training hours to ensure female teachers' participation</p>
	<p>Primary Headmasters/Headmistresses (HMs)</p>	<p># of hub/campus schools have notified HMs; hired at 17 Grade level; promotions are based on seniority</p>	<p>HMs need to play a more proactive role in implementing the student attendance monitoring program; Managing basic administration and school improvement in the new school clusters;</p>	<p><u>Design Phase:</u> 3 FGDs; Participation in Consultative Workshops;</p> <p><u>Operation Phase:</u> Quarterly review meetings with DEOs; monthly meetings with</p>	<p>Transport facilities or conveyance allowance for HMs commuting from urban areas to rural areas specially the female HMs; timely and proper utilization of</p>

			Implementation of the CPD model; Managing student transfers from satellite to upgraded elementary schools and successful transition from Class 5 to 6; They can also play important role in enrolment drives and identification of out of school children, if proper incentives and roles are built; Non-utilization of SMC annual funds by SMCs	TEOs	SMC Funds for school maintenance;
	<i>Taluka</i> Education Officers (TEOs)	Each <i>taluka</i> has 4 TEOs: 1 Primary School (Male), 1 Elementary and Secondary (Male), 1 Primary School (Female), 1 Elementary and Secondary (Female);	A TEO can have up to 400 schools but lacks capacity to provide instructional guidance and professional development support to schools; TEOs are more likely to visit urban based schools and skip rural schools because of long distances; Need to develop capacity, supported by data to engage school administration, teachers and parents for enrolment, & retention to	<u>Design Phase:</u> 4 FGDs; Participation in Consultative Workshops <u>Operation Phase:</u> 1 Annual Project Planning Meeting in Hyderabad/Sukkur at start of the project; 4 Annual Review Meetings in Hyderabad/Sukkur; Monthly planning and review meetings on competitive selection of Guide	Gap analysis for role of TEOs. Transport allowance or vehicles to cover rural schools; Field support; TA/DA for participation in Annual Project Planning Meetings; Refreshment budget for planning and review meetings; Daytime sessions to ensure participatio

			implement Component 3	Teachers and their progress with HMs at TEO Office; Monthly reporting to DEOs	n of female TEOs
District Education Officers	Present in all districts; each district has 2 DEOs: 1 Primary School, 1 Elementary and Higher Secondary	DEOs can have up to 2500 schools; They have dual responsibility of managing administrative and academic matters, but most of their time and energy are spent on administrative and legal issues; Mostly, there are not any joint or collective sessions with school heads and teachers for problem solving; Need to build their capacity to engage school administration to timely intervene for retention of students, especially girls as required in Component 3; They face trouble getting teacher transfers updated on DG HR's system		<p><u>Design Phase:</u> 5 IDIs; Participation in Consultative Workshops</p> <p><u>Operation Phase:</u> 1 Annual Project Planning Meeting in Hyderabad/Su kkur; Bi-annual Review Meetings at Divisional Headquarters; Quarterly review meetings of DEOs with primary teachers/HMs, 4 Annual Project Planning Meeting in Hyderabad/Su kkur; Quarterly meetings with HMs, PITE, and TTIs for selection and training of Guide Teachers and Subject Coordinators</p>	Gap analysis of role of DEOs; Better communication channels especially with DG HR to manage updates of teacher transfers in the system; Instituting proper reporting system; Refreshment budget for meetings

Sindh Teacher Education Development Authority (STEDA)	A sub-institute of SELD; Reports directly to Secretary Education; Accrediting body for all teacher resource and learning materials; Learning manuals and modules by PITE and TTIs have to be first approved by STEDA;	STEDA has developed a CPD model and implemented projects including Pakistan Reading Program and Sindh Reading Program; Has to further develop the program to institutionalize it within the system; Needs to institute a sustainable training mechanism for in-service training under Component 1, and possibly may also recommend the material for pre-service training as well.	<p><u>Design Phase:</u> 1 IDI with Director STEDA; Participation in Consultative Workshop</p> <p><u>Operation Phase:</u> 1 Annual Project Planning Meeting in Hyderabad/Su kkur at start of the project; 4 Annual Review Meetings in Hyderabad/Su kkur; Joint quarterly review meetings by PITE and TTIs for planning and review of training; Input of DSEs</p>	Notification of approved materials by STEDA as needed	
Provincial Institute of Training and Education (PITE)	Located in District Shaheed Benazirabad, having a segregated hostel capacity of 250; Responsible for training of in-service teachers	PITE primarily provides training to in-service teachers; Needs to work in close coordination with STEDA and TTIs in arranging and facilitating training as articulated in Component 1	<p><u>Design Phase:</u> 1 Interview with Director PITE; Participation in Consultative Workshop;</p> <p><u>Operation Phase:</u> 1 Annual Project Planning Meeting in Hyderabad/Su kkur at start of the project; 4</p>	Monetary remuneration for Master Trainers; TA/DA for Master Trainers; TA/DA for participation in annual and review meetings	

				Annual Review Meetings in Hyderabad/Su kkur; Joint quarterly review meetings by PITE, TTIs, STEDA, DCAR and DSEs for planning and review of training;	
Teacher Training Institutes TTIs	25 TTIs are spread across Sindh, one in almost each district; offer 2 years of Associate Degree in Education. It makes students eligible for Junior Elementary in official Grade 14; 4 years of B.Ed Honors. This makes students eligible for appointment in senior elementary in Grade 16; Affiliated with Karachi University, Sindh University, Khairpur and Benazirabad Universities	Training of teachers has to be delivered through the Master Trainers of TTIs using the course content developed within the project; Master Trainers will be responsible for building capacity of “Guide Teachers” and “Subject Coordinators”; Capacity development of TTIs is needed through third party service providers		<p><u>Design Phase:</u> 4 In-Depth Interviews with TTI Principals; Participation in Consultative Workshops</p> <p><u>Operation Phase:</u> 1 Annual Project Planning Meeting in Hyderabad/Su kkur at start of the project; 4 Annual Review Meetings in Hyderabad/Su kkur; Joint quarterly review meetings by PITE, STEDA, DCAR, DSEs and TTIs for planning and review of training;</p>	Monetary remuneration for Master Trainers; TA/DA for Master Trainers

	<p>Directorate of Curriculum, Assessment, and Research (DCAR)</p>	<p>Preparation of Scheme of Studies; Development and review of curricula; in-service training of Master Trainers; Development of Teacher Guides, Lesson Plans, Test items;</p>	<p>Need to timely develop learning aid and resource materials students and teachers; Needs technical assistance in establishing Early Grade Reading Assessment (EGRA) instruments and developing their implementation capacity</p>	<p><u>Design Phase:</u> 1 IDI with Director DCAR; Consultative workshop including DCAR, PITE, TTIs, DSEs & Curriculum wing.</p> <p><u>Operation Phase:</u> 1 Annual Project Planning Meeting in Hyderabad/Sukkur at start of the project; 4 Annual Review Meetings in Hyderabad/Sukkur; Joint quarterly review meetings by PITE, and TTIs for planning and review of training;</p>	<p>To be decided in detailed consultations</p>
	<p>Directorate General of Monitoring and Evaluation (DTG M&E)</p>	<p>Present in all districts; collects thumb impressions of school staff; maintains data on teachers</p>	<p>Currently, the DG of M&E leads biometric teacher attendance monitoring and regular school visits for the purpose of checks and balances; Under Component 3 DTG M&E will manage app-generated student</p>	<p><u>Design Phase:</u> 1 IDI with Director DTG M&E</p> <p><u>Operation Phase:</u> Monthly reporting</p>	<p>New Tablets/support in technology-based system; Training in developing, managing and upgrading M&E apps/system</p>

			attendance reports to be used by DEOs and TEOs to plan targeted visits to at-risk students		
	School Education Works wing	Responsible for construction activities	Construction and rehabilitation of schools as part of Component 2 might interfere with academic activities; Improper safeguards can make construction sites hazardous	<p><u>Design Phase:</u> Participation in Consultative Workshop</p> <p><u>Operation Phase:</u> As needed</p>	To be decided in detailed consultations
	Reform Support Unit	Sub-institute of SELD; responsible for project implementation, financial management; and M&E activities	Require technical assistance in implementing the project	<p><u>Design Phase:</u> 2 IDIs; meetings as required; Participation in Consultative workshops</p> <p><u>Operation Phase:</u> 1 Annual Project Planning Meeting in RSU at start of the project; 4 Annual Review Meetings at RSU ; participation in quarterly meetings; monthly updates on websites; development of project material as required</p>	Technical Assistance (TA)

3.2 Other Interested Parties (OIPs)

Engagement with the listed stakeholders is to be done through IDIs with senior management of the organizations. These include relevant government departments and development agencies and NGOs, such as The British Council, Sindh Education Foundation (SEF), The Citizens Foundation (TCF) and other reputable educational organizations. The Design Phase of SEP includes consultation. In the Operation Phase, engagement will continue in the Local Education Group (LEG) meetings as well as in other events as required by RSU.

Table 5: Level of Impact on OIPs

S.N	Other Interested Parties	Level of Impact
1	The relevant private sector development agencies having experience of CPD, such as the British Council, The Citizens Foundation and other reputable educational organizations	+ Moderate: CPD implementation knowledge and experience sharing .
2	Sindh Education Foundation (SEF)	+ Moderate: Has high enrolment functioning schools in the select districts
3	Sindh Text Book Board	+ High Responsible for publishing and distributing textbooks. However, weak collaboration with the project can adversely impact learning outcomes; opposite of the same can be an opportunity
4	Curriculum Wing	+ High: Develops guidelines for content of curriculum and teachers' resource materials
5	Sindh Environment Protection Agency (SEPA)	+ Moderate : SEPA may help in better managing construction impacts on the environment
6	Provincial Disaster Management Authority, Sindh (PDMA)	+ High: Technical assistance for disaster proofing of school designs and on disaster zoning across the selected districts
7	Sindh Building Control Authority (SBCA)	+ High: Responsible for approving the designs of the building structures.
8	DG HR& Training, SE&LD	+ High: Maintains and updates the biometric record of postings of teachers. Weak collaboration with project, in the form of delayed updating of transfer record, may affect performance of teachers and overall learning environment.

3.2.1 Issues to be Addressed for Effective and Inclusive Engagement with OIPs:

Based on secondary research, discussions with relevant entities of the SELD and informal meetings with HMs of schools in a district, the following concerns need to be addressed:

- a) The implementing agency needs to be proactive in reaching out to potential education sector partners for technical advice and support
- b) Although the project does not directly engage Sindh Text Book Board, but this agency is responsible for printing and publishing of text books and resource materials. Timelines for making printed materials available need to be stringently followed

: 3.2.2 Description of Other Interested Parties

Stakeholder Group	Identified Party	Key Characteristics	Needs/Issues	Preferred Notification and Frequency	Specific Needs
Other Interested Parties (OIPs)	The relevant non-governmental and private sector development agencies having experience of CPD, such as the British Council, The Citizens Foundation, etc.	Such development organizations have relevant experience in the field of teacher training programs.	Non-governmental educational organizations/institutes have resource material and planning documents; The project can benefit from their knowledge and experience in preparing the CPD modules	<p><u>Design Phase:</u> 3 IDIs each with head/relevant staff of The British Council, The Citizens Foundation, and other relevant educational organization of good repute</p> <p><u>Operation Phase:</u> LEG; As needed</p>	To be decided in detailed consultations
	Sindh Education Foundation	Sub Institute of SELD; operates SELD's schools in target districts	SEF is running multiple programs in the project districts, like Adopt a School Program and SEF Assisted Schools. Their experience in restructuring can offer tried and tested models and examples in defining expectations from teachers, introducing ICT Based methods, and set up of Early Childhood learning	<p><u>Design Phase:</u> 1 IDI with Executive Director SEF</p> <p><u>Operation Phase:</u> LEG; As needed</p>	To be decided in detailed consultations

			systems: Some of their schools are adopted SELD schools and can be selected first for demonstrating project outcomes, if such schools fall within the domain of the SELECT project		
	Sindh Textbook Board	Based in Hyderabad; development, printing, and publication of textbooks from grades I to XII	Needs to collaborate with the project effectively through supply of required printed material timely.	<u>Design Phase:</u> Participation in Consultative Workshop <u>Operation Phase:</u> As needed	To be decided in detailed consultations
	Curriculum Wing	Sub Institute of SELD; provides guidelines for curriculum and resource material development	It needs to work in close coordination with DCAR, PITE and STEDA to give feedback and develop timely resource materials;	<u>Design Phase:</u> 1 IDI with Advisor; Participation in Consultative Workshop <u>Operation Phase:</u> As needed	To be decided in detailed consultations
	Sindh Environment Protection Agency	Responsible to implement the Pakistan Environmental Protection Act, 1997	Project needs to coordinate effectively with SEPA for compliance of the provincial environment standards, where applicable.	<u>Design Phase:</u> Participation in Consultative Workshop <u>Operation Phase:</u> As needed	To be decided in detailed consultations
	Provincial Disaster	Implement policies and	Needs to assist district and	<u>Design Phase:</u>	To be decided in detailed

	Management Authority, Sindh (PDMA)	plans for disaster management in the province	school authorities in disaster preparedness and responsiveness	1 IDI with Director PDMA <u>Operation Phase:</u> Annual Reviews	consultations
	Sindh Building Control Authority (SBCA)	Responsible for approving the designs of the building structures.	Project needs to coordinate effectively with SBCA for compliance to legal requirements, where applicable.	<u>Design Phase:</u> Participation in Consultative Workshop <u>Operation Phase:</u> As needed	To be decided in detailed consultations
	DG HR & Training, SELD	Maintains and updates the biometric record of postings of teachers.	Needs to collaborate with the Project effectively, through prompt update in biometric record of teachers, whenever required by the Project. Weak collaboration with project, in the form of delayed updating of transfer record, may affect performance of teachers and overall learning environment.	<u>Design Phase:</u> 1 IDI with Advisor; Participation in Consultative Workshop <u>Operation Phase:</u> As needed	To be decided in detailed consultations

3.3 Disadvantaged / Vulnerable Individuals or Groups

Disadvantaged in this context refers to individuals or groups of individuals who should be the direct beneficiaries of the project, but are at risk of being alienated. Socio-cultural demand-side barriers combined with economic factors and supply-related issues (such as availability of school facility), together are likely to hamper enrolment and retention of certain marginalized groups, in particular girls and differently abled children in acquiring and continuing primary and secondary education. Similarly female teachers are at risk of being sidelined. Various NGOs are working with the identified groups in various capacities. The input from the relevant NGOs of this sector will be helpful in making the project more effective.

Table 6: Level of Impact on Disadvantaged/Vulnerable Groups

S.N	Disadvantaged Groups	Level of Impact
1	Out of School Children (OOSC)	-ve High: Many likely to be excluded because of their poor socio-economic status, limited schools, and cultural factors
2	Differently Abled Children	-ve High: The differently-abled children of certain physical disabilities can be catered in mainstream schools, however, due to Lack of facilities to facilitate such differently-abled children, or due to lack of training and awareness among teachers regarding it, such students may be alienated from the benefits of the project schools.
3	In School Children	-ve Low: Drop outs in seldom instances of abuse or corporal punishment.
4	Religious and Ethnic Minorities	-ve Low: Discrimination against minorities in schools in general is not found. However, in case of any isolated or deliberately instigated event, the institutional system and social environment have capacity to contain and reverse it
5	Female school staff	-ve Moderate: Limited mobility and cultural restrictions to effectively participate in training programs; Inadequate complaint mechanisms in case of harassment

3.3.1 Issues to be Addressed for Effective and Inclusive Engagement with Disadvantaged / Vulnerable Individuals or Groups

- a) Pakistan is said to have a large number of out-of-school-children (OOSC), estimated to be about 22.8 million aged 5-16. They represent 44 per cent of the total population in this age group⁴
- b) There are chances of student dropout or possibility of dropout in case of harassment/abuse, or physical/corporal punishment

⁴ <https://www.unicef.org/pakistan/education>

- c) Tharparkar and Thatta reportedly have high number of non-functional schools. Both these districts also face shortage of clean drinking water
- d) Sujawal, Thatta, Tharparker, Tando Muhammad Khan fall “very low” on HDI. This implies low enrolment, stunted children, non-functional schools, low skilled teachers, dilapidated school infrastructure barring basic facilities, whereby girl children, lady teachers and girls’ schools are further disadvantaged
- e) No means of counseling or therapy exists for victims of abuse or trauma. Children experiencing bullying and abuse are likely to skip school or drop out. CPD needs to include counselling training of teachers to manage students experiencing different levels of harassment and abuse; sessions for awareness of students on self-care and protection, and intervention strategies may be conducted with students and their parents through School Management Committees
- f) Effective complaint and redressal system needs to be in place in school management to promptly and effectively address the issues related to Gender-Based Violence (GBV), if any, in schools.
- g) The schools of SEF, TCF and such other reputed organizations, operating in the same areas as SELD, may be referred to for comparing gender sensitivities employed by them to support retention, especially of girls in primary and elementary schools.
- h) SELD is preparing a strategic plan to sensitize the Department on issues related to gender discrimination and equality; enhancing girl child enrolment; promotion of female staff of the department, including lady teachers; and amendment to curriculum and syllabus to reflect gender issues in the entire education system. There is a need for better collaboration between the SELECT and Curriculum Wing to support the implementation of components relevant to the project objectives.
- i) Many of the project districts are prone to natural disasters, like droughts, storms, and flooding. Schools are often used formally or informally to shelter disaster affectees. Guidelines need to be developed to ensure proper use of buildings and school resources in an event of a disaster or emergency to maintain structural integrity of the buildings.
- j) SEP will also provide guidance on citizen engagement activities especially with parents and families of the in-school and out of school children (of school going age) and will focus on suggestions for improving enrolment and retention. Citizen engagement activities will also include regular beneficiary feedback and community satisfaction surveys for the intervention schools, as per relevant PDO indicator of the Results Framework.

3.3.2 Description of Disadvantaged / Vulnerable Individuals or Groups

Stakeholder Group	Identified Party	Key Characteristics	Needs/Issues	Preferred Notification and Frequency	Specific Needs
Disadvantaged/ Vulnerable Individuals or Groups	Out of School Children and their parents	In Sindh around 80 percent of OOSCs have never been to school; 20 percent are drop outs; Mostly, the children are from the poor families, or belong to areas where schools are not available or schooling is not valued	Reportedly, majority of OOSCs are girls. In many cases, their parents do not allow them to study or beyond the primary level, due to socio-cultural traditions; Whereas, among less privileged classes, boys often do not/cannot go to school mainly due to their engagement in economic activities as child labor; In some areas socio-cultural circumstances may not be conducive for the poor or socially weak classes to access education; Targeted interventions, as envisaged in Component 3, by school and district administrations can lower the risk of drop outs at primary levels, especially of girls	<u>Design Phase:</u> 2 IDIs with NGOs working with OOSCs; <u>Operation Phase:</u> Annual enrolment campaigns by DEOs, TEOs, HMs and Teachers; Bi-annual CE activities	Placards and campaign materials in native language
	Differently Abled Children their parents	Differently abled persons make up 13.4 percent of the overall population in Pakistan	Infrastructure needs to include mobility provisions like ramps, holding stations in washing areas and latrines, etc.; Need to develop guidance material	<u>Design Phase:</u> 1 IDI with an NGO working with differently	Sensitization materials incorporated in teaching aids to promote

			for teachers to support differently-abled children with those physical disabilities which can be accommodated in mainstream schools.; Sensitization in learning lessons on how to behave around differently abled persons required	abled children <u>Operation Phase:</u> To be decided	diversity and inclusion
	In School Children (Primary)	Represent 42 percent of the student population in the select districts at the primary level; Mostly enrolled in one to two classroom-schools and learning through multi grade system; Belong mainly to lower socio-economic classes	There are chances of student dropout or possibility of dropout due to instances of harassment/abuse, or physical/corporal punishment; Further, the apprehension of occurrence of such dropout cases deepens, if there is no system/procedure to prevent or address such undesired happenings; In multi-grade set-ups, instances of bullying by older children are deemed to be high; GBV Action Plan needs to be prepared to safeguard children from such incidents, and to raise awareness and capacity of parents, teachers, village elders, etc. into responding and reporting GBV cases;	<u>Design Phase:</u> 1 IDI with an NGO working on Children's Rights,. <u>Operation Phase:</u> Classroom annual/bi-annual training on sexual abuse prevention; Project based collaboration with UNICEF, DSEs, DEOs, HMs, DG M&E, and RSU	Developing age appropriate awareness materials on sexual abuse prevention in local language; Awareness sessions among teachers, HMs and parents regarding prohibition of corporeal punishment under the relevant laws/rules of the Province.
	Children and parents of Religious and Ethnic Minorities	Sindh houses significant populations of religious and ethnic minorities; Overall the province maintains relatively	In institutional and social setups in the province the discourse and narrative usually steers clear of differences on	<u>Design Phase:</u> 1 IDI with an NGO working on religious	To be decided in detailed consultation

		better social harmony	the basis of faith and ethnicity; this needs to be further reflected in academics to maintain inter-faith peace and harmony	and ethnic minorities <u>Operation Phase:</u> CE activities	
	Female Staff	There is a total of 77,811 primary school teachers out of which 20,681 are female	To prevent possible incidences of harassment or abuse a robust GBV Action Plan needs to be developed; The GBV Action plan needs to cover reporting and corrective action mechanisms within the system	<u>Design Phase:</u> 1 FGD with NGOs working on Women's Rights, Women Development Dept., DSEs, DEOs, HMs, DG M&E, RSU team and other relevant staff of SELD. <u>Operation Phase:</u> To be decided	Transport for female teachers and TEOs commuting from urban areas to rural areas.

4. Stakeholder Engagement

Stakeholder engagement activities need to continue throughout the project life, and need to keep specific stakeholder groups updated on relevant information imperative for transparency and disclosure, successful implementation of project activities, provision of means to exchange and propose better ideas on ongoing activities, flag concerns, and stay updated on outcomes.

The proposed engagement plan has been developed keeping in mind stakeholders' stakes in the process and degree of influence.

Table 7: Stakeholders' Matrix

		DEGREE OF INFLUENCE	
		←	
		High influence	Low influence
DEGREE OF IMPORTANCE 	High	Box A: Stakeholders who stand to lose or gain significantly from the project BUT whose actions can affect the project's ability to meet its objectives Primary School Teachers DEOs TEOs PITE TTIs RSU DCAR School Education Works DG M&E STEDA Curriculum Wing	Box B: Stakeholders who stand to lose or gain significantly from the project BUT whose actions cannot affect the project's ability to meet its objectives Primary and elementary students (Grades 1-8) and their parents Elementary School Teachers Elementary Headmasters/mistresses
	Low	Sindh Textbook Board DG HR and Training PDMA SEPA	

4.1 Proposed Stakeholder Engagement Plan

Stakeholder engagement for SELECT is divided into the following two phases:

Phase I - Project Design: This formulation as presented in Table 8 is based on IDIs, FGDs, and consultations with high influence stakeholders by the consultant, such as Director STEDA; DTG M&E; Advisor Curriculum Wing; Directors Primary and Secondary Schools of Regions – Hyderabad and Mirpur Khas ; DEOs and TEOs of a few districts - Tando Mohammad Khan, Badin, Mirpurkhas & Tharparker; HMs and Primary Teachers of 2 districts; Principals TTI of three districts; Secretary of the Primary Teachers Association of a district,; management of various NGOs/Private sector organizations working on OOSCs, Project Director of international organization that implemented CPD in Sindh, etc. Consultations with other stakeholders will also be held soon.

Phase II - Project Operation: The draft SEP for this phase has been developed by the SELD/RSU Social Safeguards Consultant based on the feedback received so far through IDIs, FGDs, and literature review in Phase I. It will continue to be updated till all planned consultations in Phase I are completed. Two consultative workshops are also planned in the coming days in which the draft SEP for Project Operation Phase will be validated and endorsed in the presence of stakeholders. Their feedback and suggestions will be incorporated in the final document that will henceforth be used as a reference document. As SEP is a living document, it may be updated throughout the project life cycle.

Table 8: Project Design Phase

PHASE I: PROJECT DESIGN						
Type of Stakeholders	Target Stakeholders	Topics of Engagement	Methods Being Used	Location and Frequency	Roles and Responsibilities	
Affected Parties	Director Primary and Director Secondary Schools	DEOs and TEOs report to Director Primary and Director Secondary Schools of their respective Divisional Headquarters. Project orientation explaining key roles and responsibilities of DEOs and TEOs under the project will be given; Understanding of Recruitment process of DEOs, TEOs, HMs, and Teachers; Appraisal and reward systems; Capacity development opportunities within the system;	Workshops, consultative sessions and IDIs using semi-structured discussion guide	Divisional Headquarters at Mirpurkhas and Hyderabad; 4 IDIs; 2 Workshops for Validation of Project Implementation Phase SEP: Hyderabad and Sukkur	RSU	Social Safeguards Consultant

PHASE I: PROJECT DESIGN					
Type of Stakeholders	Target Stakeholders	Topics of Engagement	Methods Being Used	Location and Frequency	Roles and Responsibilities
		Reporting hierarchy and grievance mechanisms; Gender issues and inclusion of vulnerable groups in hiring			
	DEOs	Defining roles, responsibilities and outreach requirements under SELECT; Level and frequency of engagement with schools and other departments; Handling of complaints; Means of communication, reporting and grievance mechanisms; Gender issues and inclusion of vulnerable groups	Workshops, consultative sessions and FGDs using semi-structured discussion guide	Divisional Headquarters at Mirpurkhas and Hyderabad; 5 IDIs; 2 Workshops for Validation of Project Implementation Phase SEP: Hyderabad and Sukkur	RSU Social Safeguards Consultant
	TEOs	Understanding Terms of Reference and outreach capacity; Level and frequency of engagement with schools and DEOs; Means of communication, Reporting and grievance mechanisms; Gender issues and inclusion of vulnerable groups	Workshops, consultative sessions and FGDs using semi-structured discussion guide	Thatta and Mirpurkhas; 4 FGDs; 2 Workshops for Validation of Project Implementation Phase SEP: Hyderabad and Sukkur	RSU Social Safeguards Consultant
	Primary School Teachers	Existing teaching pedagogies; awareness about CPD, training opportunities; Availability of teaching resource materials; Reward or performance appraisal frequency and level of interaction with DEOs and TEOs, and grievance mechanisms;	Consultative sessions and FGDs with rural and urban school teachers using a semi-structured discussion guide	Hyderabad (Tando Muhammad Khan), Thatta, Mirpurkhas; 6 FGDs; 2 Workshops for Validation of Project Implementation Phase SEP: Hyderabad and	RSU Social Safeguards Consultant

PHASE I: PROJECT DESIGN					
Type of Stakeholders	Target Stakeholders	Topics of Engagement	Methods Being Used	Location and Frequency	Roles and Responsibilities
				Sukkur	
	Primary HMs	Scope of responsibilities; Level and frequency of communication with DEOs and TEOs; Interaction with teachers on their capacity development; Course of corrective action for teachers in case of non-compliance or misconduct; Grievance mechanism	Consultative sessions and FGDs with Hub and satellite school HMs using a semi-structured discussion guide	Hyderabad (Tando Muhammad Khan), Thatta, Mirpurkhas; 3 FGDs; 2 Workshops for Validation of Project Implementation Phase SEP: Hyderabad and Sukkur	SELD/RSU Social Safeguards Consultant
	STEDA, PITE, TTIs, and DCAR,	Role in developing and executing the CPD model; Means of communication and engagement for developing resource materials; In-house capacity to roll out training; level and frequency of engagement required with other departments; Challenges; Reporting and grievance mechanisms	IDIs and telephonic interviews with heads of the departments using a semi-structured discussion guide	Karachi, Jamshoro; 7 IDIs/Telephonic Interviews;	SELD/RSU Social Safeguards Consultant
	Directorate General of Monitoring and Evaluation (DTG M&E)	Inclusion of grievance mechanisms in reporting	IDI with head of the department using a semi-structured discussion guide	Karachi; 1 IDI; 1 Workshop for Validation of Project Implementation Phase SEP: Hyderabad	SELD/RSU Social Safeguards Consultant
Reform Support Unit	Capacity development to implement the project; Coordination for information sharing and setting up meetings	Meetings, workshops, LEG meeting, and informal consultation sessions	Meetings, workshops, LEG meeting, and informal consultation sessions	Karachi; 2 IDIs; Meetings (as needed) 2 Workshops for	SELD/RSU Social Safeguards

PHASE I: PROJECT DESIGN					
Type of Stakeholders	Target Stakeholders	Topics of Engagement	Methods Being Used	Location and Frequency	Roles and Responsibilities
		with other departments; Logistical support for meetings; Data on school and district/ <i>taluka</i> level stakeholders		Validation of Project Implementation Phase SEP: Hyderabad and Sukkur	Consultant
Other Interested Parties	The relevant non-governmental/private sector development agencies having experience of CPD, such as the British Council, The Citizens Foundation, etc.	Experience in implementing CPD model in Sindh; Resource material developed and used, criteria for guide and subject coordinators selection; Challenges	Face to face interview using a semi structured checklist	Karachi; 3 IDIs	RSU Social Safeguards Consultant
	Sindh Education Foundation	Project approach, pedagogies applied, enrolment strategies, teachers' training resources	Face to face interview using a semi structured guide	Karachi; 1 IDI	RSU Social Safeguards Consultant
	Curriculum Wing	Role and responsibilities; Resource material development cycle; How to improve the process	Face to face interview using a semi structured checklist	Karachi; 1 IDI	RSU Social Safeguards Consultant
	Sindh Environment Protection Agency (SEPA)	Project needs to coordinate effectively with SEPA for compliance of the provincial environment standards, where applicable.	IDI with Director General using a semi structured checklist	Karachi; 1 IDI	RSU Social Safeguards Consultant
	Provincial Disaster Management Authority, Sindh (PDMA)	Needs to assist district and school authorities in disaster preparedness and responsiveness	IDI with Director General using a semi structured checklist	Participation in Consultative Workshop	RSU Social Safeguards Consultant

PHASE I: PROJECT DESIGN					
Type of Stakeholders	Target Stakeholders	Topics of Engagement	Methods Being Used	Location and Frequency	Roles and Responsibilities
	DG HR & Training, SELD	Needs to collaborate with the Project effectively, through prompt update in biometric record of teachers, whenever required by the Project; Weak collaboration with project, in the form of delayed updating of transfer record, may affect performance of teachers and overall learning environment	IDI with Director General using a semi structured checklist	Karachi; 1 IDI	RSU Social Safeguards Consultant
Disadvantaged /Vulnerable Individuals or Groups	NGOs Representing Out of School Children and their Parent, UNICEF, DSEs, DEOs, HMs, DG M&E, RSU team and other relevant staff of SELD.	Data and figures; successful interventions to enroll OOSC; retention	FGD	Karachi; 2 IDIs	RSU Social Safeguards Consultant
	NGOs Representing Differently Abled Children and their Parents	Data and figures on enrolment in mainstream schools; barriers, if any, to entry; successful interventions; Grievance system	Interview using a semi structured checklist	Karachi; 1 IDI	RSU Social Safeguards Consultant
	NGOs representing minority and	Data and figures on school level employment and enrolment; means of discrimination, if any;	Interviews with rural based NGOs using a semi structured	1 Project District; 1 IDI	RSU Social Safeguards Consultant

PHASE I: PROJECT DESIGN					
Type of Stakeholders	Target Stakeholders	Topics of Engagement	Methods Being Used	Location and Frequency	Roles and Responsibilities
	ethnic groups in Sindh	Grievance system	checklist		
	NGOs working on children's and women's rights in Sindh, UNICEF, DSEs, DEOs, HMs, DG M&E, RSU team and other relevant staff of SELD, Women Development Deptt.	Data and figures on school level; informal and formal grievance systems' successes and failures;	FGD	Karachi; 1 FGD	RSU Social Safeguards Consultant
	All Sindh Primary School Teachers' Association	Issues in teaching; satisfaction or dissatisfaction over facilities and perks; capacity development opportunities;	IDI using a semi structured checklist	Karachi 1 IDI	RSU Social Safeguards Consultant

Table 9: Project Operation Stage

PHASE II: PROJECT OPERATION					
Type of Stakeholders	Target Stakeholders	Topics of Engagement	Methods to be used	Location and Frequency	Roles and Responsibilities
Affected Parties	Primary Students (Grades 1 – 3) ; Parents; SMCs	Level of interest in education; Proficiency in reading; attendance	Assessments; monitoring of attendance through Unique Student ID	Quarterly and annual assessments; Daily attendance; Annual Citizen Engagement Surveys	Subject coordinators will take quarterly assessments to evaluate learning

PHASE II: PROJECT OPERATION					
Type of Stakeholders	Target Stakeholders	Topics of Engagement	Methods to be used	Location and Frequency	Roles and Responsibilities
					outcomes and share results with TEOs in monthly meetings; WB
	Directorate Primary and Secondary Schools	Project orientation; Outlining of key roles and responsibilities; project planning and setting timelines; Dedicating focal persons for coordination and reporting vertically and horizontally; Project review and performance appraisal;	Training and Planning workshops; Meetings with DEOs on CPD model and school upgradation; Instituting effective online systems for receiving and reviewing suggestions, complaints, and grievances; Regular hearings of grievances by grievance committees	1 Annual Project Planning Meeting in Hyderabad at start of the project; 4 Annual Review Meetings in Hyderabad; bi-annual review meetings of Directors with DEOs at Divisional Headquarters; monthly review and action on attendance reports and reported grievances	Directorates of School Education and Project Directorate at RSU
	DEOs	Formats and frequency of engagement with HMs and teachers to identify learning needs and gaps; Means of coordination and communication with HMs, PITE and TTIs for selecting and training Guide Teachers; Reporting to Directors and RSU on project progress and upgradation of primary schools to elementary; Announcing and	Review meetings with HMs and project partners; Report possible changes in school status and transfer of teachers through written notification; Share knowledge of grievance reporting system through	Bi-annual Review Meetings at Divisional Headquarters; quarterly review meetings of DEOs with primary teachers, 1 Annual Project Planning Meeting in Hyderabad at start of the project; 3 Annual Review Meetings in Hyderabad HMs, PITE, and TTIs for	DEOs of the selected 10 districts responsible for maintaining and filing plans; consolidating monthly and quarterly project documents and

PHASE II: PROJECT OPERATION					
Type of Stakeholders	Target Stakeholders	Topics of Engagement	Methods to be used	Location and Frequency	Roles and Responsibilities
		implementing grievance mechanisms; Outreach programs for disadvantaged groups; Gender training and inclusive approaches	printed posters/notices; Placement of complaint boxes in schools	selection and training of Guide Teachers; monthly checking and filing of complaints in complaint boxes	sharing timely with Project Directorate at RSU copying their respective School Directorates
	TEOs	Formats and frequency of engagement with primary teachers and HMs; Performance appraisal indicators and formats; Gender training and inclusive approaches	Joint meetings with HMs; Performance appraisal of primary teachers; Reporting to DEOs	1 Annual Project Planning Meeting in Hyderabad at start of the project; 3 Annual Review Meetings in Hyderabad Monthly planning and review meetings on competitive selection of Guide Teachers and their progress with HMs at cluster hub/campus schools; monthly reporting to DEOs	TEOs to share monthly reports with DEOs. The latter is to review, consolidate with monthly report and share with Project Directorate at RSU copying their respective School Directorates
	Primary School Teachers	Willingness to learn and apply new pedagogies and assessments; Means of communication with Guide Teachers and Subject Coordinators; Participation in training; Reporting progress and grievances	Training in new pedagogies Developing Teaching guides available in Sindhi and Urdu in hard and soft copies at Hub Schools; Training calendar developed and hard copies	1 Annual Project Planning Meeting in Hyderabad at start of the project; 3 Annual Review Meetings in Hyderabad Annual Training for different batches of teachers (can be at PITE or District TTI); monthly review meetings of Guide	PITE to develop Training Calendar and share it with TTIs, DEOs, TEOs, HMs, Project Directorate at RSU Monthly/bi-

PHASE II: PROJECT OPERATION					
Type of Stakeholders	Target Stakeholders	Topics of Engagement	Methods to be used	Location and Frequency	Roles and Responsibilities
			shared with DEOs, TEOs, HMs; Soft copy to be made available on website; Online link training resource material developed and shared on school's notice boards	and Subject Coordinators at Hub schools; bi-weekly meetings of Subject Coordinators and teachers at satellite schools; weekly mentoring by Subject Coordinators to teachers at satellite schools	weekly/weekly reports developed and shared by teachers with TEOs. DEOs to review and shared monthly with Project Directorate at RSU copying their respective School Directorates
	Primary HMs	Scope of responsibilities; Level and frequency of communication with DEOs and TEOs; Interaction with teachers on their capacity development; Course of corrective action for teachers in case of non-compliance or misconduct; grievance mechanism	Bi-Monthly meetings with written agenda and action points	Quarterly review meetings with DEOs; monthly meetings with TEOs	Maintain meeting minutes
	Elementary HMs	Capacity development to provide better academic support to teachers; Maintenance of school building; Effective use of learning resources and facilities	Review meetings with DEOs on the state and use of facilities	Quarterly meetings with DEOs	DEOs to share quarterly reports with Project Directorate at RSU copying their respective School Directorates

PHASE II: PROJECT OPERATION					
Type of Stakeholders	Target Stakeholders	Topics of Engagement	Methods to be used	Location and Frequency	Roles and Responsibilities
	STEDA, PITE, TTIs, DCAR, and Curriculum Wing	Role in developing and executing the CPD model; Determining the training development cycle; Means of communication and engagement for developing resource materials; In-house capacity to roll out training; Level and frequency of engagement required with other departments; Challenges; Reporting and grievance mechanisms	Planning and review workshops; Joint working groups; Official notification	1 Annual Project Planning Meeting in Hyderabad/Sukkur at start of the project; 4 Annual Review Meetings in Hyderabad/Sukkur; Joint quarterly review meetings by PITE and TTIs for planning and review of training; notification of approved materials by STEDA as needed	PITE to take lead on planning and consolidating reports to be shared quarterly with Project Directorate at RSU
	Directorate General of Monitoring & Evaluation (DTG M&E)	Improving monitoring and evaluation systems	Regular reporting on attendance of teachers	Monthly reporting	DTG M&E
	School Education Works	Planning and mobilization of construction activities; Timelines; Guidelines for ensuring environmental and social safeguards, making building friendly for the use of the differently abled	Feasibility assessment of schools for construction; Approval and written notice from Secretary Education	As needed	PMIU will conduct the feasibility assessment; Civil Works to undertake construction activity
	Reform Support Unit	Capacity development to implement the project; Coordination for information sharing and setting up meetings with other departments; Logistical support for meetings; Data on	Develop on-line Project materials; disclosure of project documents; Organizing and participating annual	1 Annual Project Planning Meeting in RSU at start of the project; 4 Annual Review Meetings in RSU; participation in quarterly meetings; monthly	Overall project management and coordination

PHASE II: PROJECT OPERATION					
Type of Stakeholders	Target Stakeholders	Topics of Engagement	Methods to be used	Location and Frequency	Roles and Responsibilities
		school and district/ <i>taluka</i> level stakeholders	planning and review meetings; Maintaining project activity calendar and sending reminders to other departments; Developing publicity materials and case studies for electronic and social media	updates on websites; development of project material as required	
Other Interested Parties	The relevant private sector development agencies having experience of CPD, such as the British Council, The Citizen Foundation, etc.	Experience in implementing CPD model in Sindh; Resource material developed and used, criteria for guide and subject coordinators selection; Challenges	Face-to-face meetings; Trainings/workshops; Invitations to public consultations	As needed	DCAR, Curriculum Wing and PITE to coordinate for relevant input
	Sindh Education Foundation	-Strategies for high enrolment and retention of girls; Teaching pedagogies and resource materials used	Face-to-face meetings; Trainings/workshops; Invitations to public consultations	As needed	DCAR, Curriculum Wing and PITE to coordinate for relevant input
Disadvantaged /Vulnerable Individuals or Groups	NGOs Representing Out of School Children and	Factors contributing to attract girls and OOSCs to join school; Key lessons learnt from the projects	Participation in Local Education Group (LEG) meetings; Citizen Engagement	As planned; CE annual	WB; RSU

PHASE II: PROJECT OPERATION					
Type of Stakeholders	Target Stakeholders	Topics of Engagement	Methods to be used	Location and Frequency	Roles and Responsibilities
	their Parents		Surveys		
	NGOs Representing Differently Abled Children and their Parents	Learning needs; teaching pedagogies; Sensitization required through different channels	Participation in Local Education Group (LEG) meetings; Citizen Engagement Surveys	As planned; CE annual	WB; RSU
	NGOs representing religious minority and ethnic groups in Sindh	How to maintain inter-faith religious harmony and equality and champion it across the province; How to prevent formal or informal infiltration of hate material in educational discourse; How to respond to incidences of discrimination against religious and ethnic minority, if any	Learning aids on inclusion and inter-faith harmony; Citizen Engagement Surveys	As planned; CE annual	Curriculum Wing, DCAR, STEDA
	NGOs working on Children's and women's rights in Sindh	Factors contributing to attract girls; Key lessons learnt from the projects;	Participation in Local Education Group (LEG) meetings	As planned; CE annual	RSU
	All Sindh Primary School Teachers' Association	Issues in teaching; satisfaction or dissatisfaction over facilities and perks; Capacity development opportunities;	Participation in Local Education Group (LEG) meetings	As planned	RSU

4.2 Proposed Strategy to Include Vulnerable Groups

The project will take special measures to ensure that disadvantaged and vulnerable groups have equal opportunity to access information, provide feedback, or submit grievances. Civil society organizations, including NGOs working on ethnic groups, children's rights, women's rights, teachers' associations will also be consulted in this connection. Their engagement will facilitate to factor in opportunities for the identified vulnerable groups. TEOs and HMs will help to ensure proactive outreach to OOSC in their *talukas* for awareness and enrolment. Complaint boxes in schools will be placed near school entrance for vulnerable groups to drop complaints. Open house sessions organized will demonstrate to children and parents alike better learning outcomes. Education projects from other donors and development agencies targeting vulnerable groups will be encouraged.

4.3 Strategy for Consultation (Design Phase)

4.3.1 In-Depth Interviews

Face-to-face interviews using semi-structured guides have already been held with various stakeholders from the Education Department. Further IDIs with the other identified stakeholders are planned and will remain the core method of data collection for the design phase.

A total of 31 IDIs will be undertaken covering all relevant parties and ensuring their feedback.

4.3.2 Focus Group Discussions

2 FGDs have been held so far with primary school teachers and HMs of a project district. 5 FGDs with primary teachers and 2 more FGDs with HMs from two project districts are planned. Gender split in FGDs will be ensured to cover sensitive topics of harassment comfortably. 4 FGDs with TEOs in Thatta and Mirpurkhas with an equal gender split will be conducted.

A total of 14 FGDs are planned to be covered in the design phase. In each FGD minimum 6 and maximum 10 respondents will participate.

4.3.3 Telephone Interviews

Telephonic interviews may also be done using semi structured guides, with Director PITE, and Directors of TTIs in the project districts. However, preference will be given to face-to-face interviews.

4.3.4 Workshops for Validation of Proposed SEP – Implementation Phase

The consultations in the design phase will culminate in an augmented proposed SEP for the implementation phase. Ideas, suggestions, and views of the stakeholders will be well documented and presented in workshops attended by the representatives of the identified stakeholders. The workshops will be divided into reviewing, brainstorming, and planning sessions to finalize a mutually agreed upon Stakeholder Engagement Plan.

To encourage participation, 2 workshops will be held: one in divisional region of Hyderabad and the other in the divisional region of Sukkur.

4.4 Information Disclosure

SELD and WB websites will be used to disclose project documents, locally and internationally, including those on environmental and social performance in Urdu and English. SELD will create a webpage on the Project on its existing website. All future project related environmental and social monitoring reports, listed in the above sections will be disclosed on this webpage. Project updates (including news on construction activities and relevant environmental and social data) will also be posted on the homepage of RSU's website. An easy-to-understand guide to the terminology used in the environmental and social reports or documents will also be provided on the website. All information brochures/fliers will be posted on the website. Details about the Project Grievance Resolution Mechanism will be posted on the website. An electronic grievance submission form will also be made available on RSU's website. Contact details of the Project Coordinator will be made available on the website. RSU will update and maintain the website regularly (at least once a quarterly basis).

4.5 Timelines of SEP

Tables 7 and 8 present frequencies for different types of stakeholders. Frequency of engagement is dependent on expected deliverables. Annual meetings and reviews are to help stay course the planned activities. Quarterly, monthly, bi-weekly, and weekly engagement are relevant for effective implementation, brainstorming, addressing glitches and potential road blocks. In case of change of plans the stated timelines and frequencies will continue throughout the project life cycle, unless stated timelines and frequencies are also needed to be amended by the stakeholders, based on strong reasons. The project will review its engagement against the SEP annually, and this review will be a part of the progress report that will be shared with the client management and with the World Bank.

4.6 Review of Comments

Developing easy project reporting formats is going to be the output of stakeholder engagement. All implementing agencies are expected to send their monthly, quarterly, and yearly reports to RSU. RSU will compile comments and suggestion from various sources. Where RSU is meant to address the comments, it will promptly do so, where other agencies are involved, RSU will redirect the comments to relevant agencies for response.

5. Roles, Responsibilities, and Resources for Stakeholder Engagement Plan

5.1 Implementation Arrangements

The Project aims to work closely with SELD and the RSU under the leadership of Secretary SELD to ensure project sustainability. The Project expects the SELD directorates to be the technical leads of the activities, and the RSU to lead the fiduciary and safeguard administration based on its extensive institutional experience in implementing various donor projects.

A Social Specialist will oversee the implementation of the project SEP with support from RSU. In addition, RSU will designate environment and social focal points within the department. The project will also undertake measures for institutional capacity building including for the implementation of the SEP and will regularly organize trainings for the Project Directorate and RSU staff.

5.2 Management Functions and Responsibilities

RSU will be responsible for implementation and monitoring of the project through provision of Technical Assistance (TA) support for strengthening the SELD's and implementing entities' capacity. RSU will be headed by the Chief Program Manager (CPM) and will carry out the following tasks: (a) procurement activities under the Component 4 and procurement support for other components, (b) financial management and audit for the overall project, (c) safeguards monitoring and reporting for the entire project, (d) project specific M&E, including impact evaluation and Annual School Census (ASC), to ensure regular data collection for the entire school education sector in Sindh.

The CPM will be supported by a Deputy CPM and staff officers. Consultants and assistants will be hired for supporting financial management, procurement, M&E, social and environment safeguards. Technical consultants for teacher training, diagnostic assessments, monitoring systems, infrastructure management and EdTech solutions may be hired on need basis to support institutional strengthening of implementing entities. Detailed staffing plan will be explained in the Project Orientation Manuals (POM).

The main implementing government counterparts for Component 1 will be STEDA, PITE, TTIs and Directorate of School Education (DSE). Component 2 will be coordinated by the Project Monitoring and Implementation Unit (PMIU)., Component 3 will be mainly led by DSE with DTG M&E monitoring student attendance for verification purposes. The RSU will engage necessary technical assistance and consultants and assign them to the relevant directorates for supporting implementation as envisaged in Component 4

5.3 Budget

To be added

6. Grievance Mechanism

RSU has online complaints system, however, it needs to be made fully functional and kept updated. The status of the complaints report also needs to include the updated status on the response of the responding agency regarding the complaint. The existing system further needs changes to be accessible to a wider audience, apart from teachers and HMs.

The effectiveness of the entire system described above needs to be evaluated for its timely response, engagement process and frequency of communication with the complainant, complaint handling time and resolution process.

Grievance mechanism needs to be audience appropriate and more accessible. Complaint boxes may also be placed in schools near entrance. The complaint boxes should be locked and opened by M&E Officers on their monthly visits. They will record the complaints in a log and forward it to respective DEOs, School Directors, and RSU. The grievance log should be reviewed monthly for swift action.

Similarly, a hotline line can be instituted at Directorate M&E free of cost to encourage vulnerable individuals to report misconduct by staff within the system.

SEP will also provide guidance on Citizen Engagement (CE) activities especially with parents and families of the in-school and out of school children (of school going age) and will focus on suggestions for improving enrolment and retention. CE activities will also include regular beneficiary feedback and community satisfaction surveys for the intervention schools

7. Monitoring and Reporting

7.1 Involving of Stakeholders in Monitoring Activities

The RSU will play the overall monitoring role and undertake M&E activities, including (a) regular supervision of project implementation sites; (b) preparing biannual implementation progress reports; (c) monitoring and verification of DLIs by involving third-party entities; (d) carrying out assessment and impact evaluation studies; and (e) conducting citizens' engagement surveys for ensuring beneficiaries' and communities' satisfaction. Necessary TA support will be provided to RSU for carrying out the listed M&E activities. Project documents and reports shared by stakeholders throughout the life cycle will provide necessary reference data for monitoring and evaluation.

Moreover, ESCP and SEP require regular consultations with stakeholders. Six-monthly ESCP compliance monitoring reports would be prepared and submitted by the Environment and Social specialist(s) of the project throughout the project life.

7.2 Monitoring Grievance Mechanism

Existing systems are not adequate in monitoring grievances. Complaint registration is to be documented by developing a monthly log at the school level and collected by Directorate M&E. Appropriate measures/KPIs for this will include monthly reporting on the number of grievances received, resolved and outstanding. As part of the annual review, analyzing the trends and time taken for grievance resolution will help evaluate the efficacy of the comment response and develop more robust grievance mechanism.